

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PREFACE / 16

CHAPTER ONE DEFINING VICTIM, BENEFICIARY, AND THE RIGHT OF ACTION

- I. INTRODUCTION / 19

- II. NORMATIVE FRAMEWORK / 19
 - A. AMERICAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS / 19
 - Article 1 / 19
 - Article 63 / 20
 - B. RULES OF PROCEDURE OF THE INTER-AMERICAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS / 20
 - Article 2. Definitions / 20
 - Article 50. Convocation of Alleged Victims, Witnesses, and Expert Witnesses / 20
 - C. RULES OF PROCEDURE OF THE INTER-AMERICAN COMMISSION ON HUMAN RIGHTS / 20
 - Article 23. Presentation of Petitions / 20
 - D. BASIC PRINCIPLES AND GUIDELINES ON THE RIGHT TO A REMEDY AND REPARATION FOR VICTIMS OF GROSS VIOLATIONS OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW AND SERIOUS VIOLATIONS OF INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW / 21

- III. DEFINING VICTIMS AND OTHER INJURED PARTIES / 22
 - Blake v. Guatemala / 22
 - Bamaca Velasquez v. Guatemala / 23
 - Juvenile Reeducation Institute v. Paraguay / 25
 - Moiwana Community v. Suriname / 26

The Ituango Massacres v. Colombia / 28
Miguel Castro Castro Prison v. Peru / 31
The Saramaka People v. Suriname / 32
Ticona Estrada et al. v. Bolivia / 34
Valle Jaramillo et al. v. Colombia / 35
Radilla-Pacheco v. Mexico / 38
ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT'S
JURISPRUDENCE / 42

IV. IDENTIFICATION OF BENEFICIARIES ENTITLED TO
REPARATIONS / 43

Velasquez Rodriguez v. Honduras / 43
Aloeboetoe et al. v. Suriname / 44
Loayza Tamayo v. Peru / 47
Cantoral Benavides v. Peru / 50
Bamaca Velasquez v. Guatemala / 53
Myrna Mack Chang v. Guatemala / 54
Mapiripán Massacre v. Colombia / 55
Chaparro Álvarez and Lapo Íñiguez v. Ecuador / 56
Uson Ramirez v. Venezuela / 59
The Massacres of El Mozote and Nearby Places v. El Salvador / 61
Atala Riffo and Daughters v. Chile / 64
Santo Domingo Massacre v. Colombia / 67
ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT'S
JURISPRUDENCE / 69

V. SUCCESSORS AND HEIRS / 72

Aloeboetoe et al. v. Suriname / 72
Bulacio v. Argentina / 75
Mapiripán Massacre v. Colombia / 76
Supreme Court of Justice (Quintana Coello et al.) v. Ecuador / 77
ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT'S
JURISPRUDENCE / 78

VI. SOCIETY AS VICTIM / 79

Compulsory Membership in an Association Prescribed by

Law for the Practice of Journalism (Arts. 13 and 29 American Convention on Human Rights) / 79
The Last Temptation of Christ (Olmedo Bustos et al) v. Chile / 80
YATAMA v. Nicaragua / 81
Canese v. Paraguay / 83
Claude Reyes v. Chile / 85
Palamara Iribarne v. Chile / 86
Afro-Descendant Communities Displaced from the Cacarica River Basin (Operation Genesis) v. Colombia / 87
ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT'S JURISPRUDENCE / 94

VII. THE VICTIMS' LEGAL ASSISTANCE FUND / 95

The Kichwa Indigenous People of Sarayaku v. Ecuador / 95
The Massacres of El Mozote and Surrounding Areas v. El Salvador / 99
Furlan and Family v. Argentina / 104
ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT'S JURISPRUDENCE / 108

**CHAPTER TWO
COMPENSATION FOR DAMAGES**

I. INTRODUCTION / 119

II. NORMATIVE FRAMEWORK / 120

A. AMERICAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS / 120

Article 10. Right to Compensation / 120

Article 21. Right to Property / 120

Article 63. / 120

B. BASIC PRINCIPLES AND GUIDELINES ON THE RIGHT TO A REMEDY AND REPARATION FOR VICTIMS OF GROSS VIOLATIONS OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW AND SERIOUS VIOLATIONS OF INTERNATIONAL HUMANITARIAN LAW / 120

III. PECUNIARY DAMAGES / 121

- A. LOSS OF EARNINGS (LUCRUM CESSANS) / 121
1. GENERAL / 123
 - Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras / 121
 - Aloeboetoe et al. v. Suriname / 123
 - El Amparo v. Venezuela / 125
 - Myrna Mack Chang v. Guatemala / 126
 - Ivcher Bronstein v. Peru / 128
 - Miguel Castro Castro Prison v. Peru / 129
 - Ticona Estrada et al. v. Bolivia / 130
 - Torres Millacura v. Argentina / 132
 - Gutiérrez and Family v. Argentina / 134
 - The Landaeta Mejías Brothers et al. v. Venezuela / 136
 - Expelled Dominicans and Haitians v. Dominican Republic / 138
 - Rodriguez Vera et al. (“the Disappeared from the Palace of Justice”) v. Colombia / 140
 2. LUCRUM CESSANS FOR CHILDREN / 142
 - “Street Children” (Villagrán-Morales et al.) v. Guatemala / 142
 - Bulacio vs. Argentina / 144
 - Juvenile Reeducation Institute vs. Paraguay / 145
- ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT’S JURISPRUDENCE / 147
- B. OTHER DIRECT AND CONSEQUENTIAL DAMAGES (DANNUM EMERGENS) / 148
- Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras / 148
 - Aloeboetoe et al. v. Suriname / 148
 - Bulacio vs. Argentina / 149
 - Myrna Mack Chang v. Guatemala / 149
 - Juvenile Reeducation Institute v. Paraguay / 150
 - Chaparro Álvarez and Lapo Íñiguez v. Ecuador / 151
 - Salvador Chiriboga v. Ecuador / 153
- ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT’S JURISPRUDENCE / 159

C. LIFE PLAN (“PROYECTO DE VIDA”) / 160

Loayza Tamayo v. Peru / 160

Cantoral Benavides v. Peru / 163

Gutiérrez Soler v. Colombia / 164

ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE
COURT’S JURISPRUDENCE / 165

IV. NON-PECUNIARY DAMAGES / 166

Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras / 167

Aloeboetoe et al. v. Suriname / 167

El Amparo v. Venezuela / 169

“Street Children” (Villagrán-Morales et al.) v. Guatemala / 169

Juvenile Reeducation Institute v. Paraguay / 172

Pueblo Bello Massacre v. Colombia / 174

Miguel Castro Castro Prison v. Peru / 176

Saramaka People v. Suriname / 180

Xákmok Kásek Indigenous Community v. Paraguay / 182

Salvador Chiriboga v. Ecuador / 185

Rio Negro Massacres v. Guatemala / 187

Santo Domingo Massacre v. Colombia / 191

Rivera v. Peru / 192

Rodríguez Vera et al. (“the Disappeared from the Palace of
Justice”) v. Colombia / 194

ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT’S
JURISPRUDENCE / 196

V. PUNITIVE DAMAGES / 197

Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras / 197

Garrido and Baigorria v. Argentina / 198

ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT’S
JURISPRUDENCE / 199

VI. CONDITIONS FOR PAYMENTS / 199

Aloeboetoe et al. v. Suriname / 200

Bulacio vs. Argentina / 202

ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT’S
JURISPRUDENCE / 203

VII. COSTS & EXPENSES / 203
El Amparo v. Venezuela / 203
Ivcher Bronstein v. Peru / 204
Cesti Hurtado v. Peru / 205
Juan Humberto Sánchez v. Honduras / 208
Bulacio vs. Argentina / 210
19 Merchants v. Colombia / 212
Chaparro Álvarez y Lapo Íñiguez. v. Ecuador / 213
Artavia Murillo et. al (“In Vitro Fertilization”) v. Costa Rica / 215
Mendoza v. Argentina / 217
ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT’S JURISPRUDENCE / 218

CHAPTER THREE
BEYOND COMPENSATION: RESTITUTIO IN INTEGRUM

I. INTRODUCTION / 225
II. NORMATIVE FRAMEWORK / 236
A. Basic Principles and Guidelines on the Right to a Remedy and Reparation for Victims of Gross Violations of Interna- tional Human Rights Law and Serious Violations of Interna- tional Humanitarian Law / 236
B. Draft Articles on State Responsibility for Internationally Wrongful Acts with Commentaries / 238
III. RESTITUTION / 241
Aloeboetoe et al. v. Suriname / 242
Loayza Tamayo v. Peru / 242
Apitz Barbera et al. v. Venezuela / 243
González et al. (“Cotton Field”) v. Mexico / 245
Yakye Axa Indigenous Community v. Paraguay / 246
Sawhoyamaxa Indigenous Community v. Paraguay / 250
Saramaka People v. Suriname / 253
Xákmok Kásek Indigenous Community v. Paraguay / 265
The Kichwa Indigenous People of Sarayaku v. Ecuador / 272

The Massacres of El Mozote and Nearby Places v. El Salvador / 275
Wong Ho Wing v. Peru / 279
ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT'S
JURISPRUDENCE / 281

IV. REHABILITATION / 283

Plan de Sanchez Massacre v. Guatemala / 283
Radilla-Pacheco v. Mexico / 285
Rosendo Cantú et al. v. Mexico / 286
Atala Riffo and Daughters v. Chile / 293
Furlan and Family v. Argentina / 295
The Massacres of El Mozote and Nearby Places v. El Salvador / 302
Artavia Murillo et al. (“In Vitro Fertilization”) v. Costa Rica / 304
Mendoza et al. v. Argentina / 306
García Lucero et al. v. Chile / 313
J. v. Peru / 316
Espinoza Gonzáles v. Peru / 318
Gonzales Lluy et al. v. Ecuador / 319
ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT'S
JURISPRUDENCE / 320

V. SATISFACTION / 322

A. OBLIGATION TO INVESTIGATE, PROSECUTE AND
PUNISH / 322

Velásquez Rodríguez v. Honduras / 322
El Ámparo v. Venezuela / 325
Bulacio v. Argentina / 326
Almonacid-Arellano et al. v. Chile / 328
Saramaka People v. Suriname / 331
Valle Jaramillo et al. v. Colombia / 332
González et al. (“Cotton Field”) v. Mexico / 332
Radilla-Pacheco v. Mexico / 340
Rosendo Cantú et al. v. Mexico / 348
Torres Millacura v. Argentina / 354
The Massacres of El Mozote and Nearby Places v. El
Salvador / 356
Mendoza et al. v. Argentina / 361

B. PUBLIC APOLOGY, ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF
RESPONSIBILITY AND COMMEMORATION OF THE
VICTIM / 362

- The Mayagna (Sumo) Awas Tingni Community v.
Nicaragua / 362
- Plan de Sanchez Massacre v. Guatemala / 363
- Yakye Axa Indigenous Community v. Paraguay / 365
- YATAMA v. Nicaragua / 366
- González et al. (“Cotton Field”) v. Mexico / 367
- Radilla-Pacheco v. Mexico / 368
- Xákmok Kásek Indigenous Community v. Paraguay / 369
- Rosendo Cantú et al. v. Mexico / 370
- Atala Riffo and Daughters v. Chile / 371
- The Kichwa Indigenous People of Sarayaku v. Ecuador / 372
- The Massacres of El Mozote and Nearby Places v. El
Salvador / 373
- Mendoza et al. v. Argentina / 375
- Gonzales Lluy et al. v. Ecuador / 375

ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT’S
JURISPRUDENCE / 376

VI. GUARANTEES OF NON-REPETITION / 378

A. ORDERING LEGAL REFORM / 378

- El Amparo v. Venezuela / 378
- “The Last Temptation of Christ” (Olmedo Bustos et
al.) v. Chile / 380
- Herrera-Ulloa v. Costa Rica / 382
- Moiwana Community v. Suriname / 386
- YATAMA v. Nicaragua / 388
- Girls Yean and Bosico v. Dominican Republic / 388
- Sawhoyamaya Indigenous Community v. Paraguay / 390
- Yvon Neptune v. Haiti / 391
- Radilla-Pacheco v. Mexico / 392
- Fernandez Ortega et al. v. Mexico / 394
- Rosendo Cantú et al. v. Mexico / 396

Atala Riffo and Daughters v. Chile / 399
The Kichwa Indigenous People of Sarayaku v. Ecuador / 400
Furlan and Family v. Argentina / 402
Artavia Murillo et al. (“In Vitro Fertilization”) v.
Costa Rica / 405
Mendoza et al. v. Argentina / 406
Human Rights Defender et al. v. Guatemala / 408

B. INCOMPATIBILITY OF AMNESTY LAWS WITH
HUMAN RIGHTS / 410

Barrios Altos v. Peru / 410
Almonacid-Arellano et al. v. Chile / 411
Gomes Lund et al. (Guerrilha do Araguaia) v. Brazil / 414
Gelman v. Uruguay / 419
Espinoza Gonzáles v. Peru / 426

C. HUMAN RIGHTS EDUCATION AND TRAINING / 427

Myrna Mack Chang v. Guatemala / 427
Girls Yean and Bosico v. Dominican Republic / 427
“Mapiripán Massacre” v. Colombia / 428
Ximenes-Lopes v. Brazil / 429
Miguel Castro-Castro Prison v. Peru / 430
González et al. (“Cotton Field”) v. Mexico / 430
Radilla-Pacheco v. Mexico / 433
Rosendo Cantú et al. v. Mexico / 435
Atala Riffo and Daughters v. Chile / 437
The Kichwa Indigenous People of Sarayaku v. Ecuador / 438
Furlan and Family v. Argentina / 438
The Massacres of El Mozote and Nearby Places v. El
Salvador / 439
Artavia Murillo et al. (“In Vitro Fertilization”) v.
Costa Rica / 440
Mendoza et al. v. Argentina / 440

ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT’S
JURISPRUDENCE / 441

CHAPTER FOUR
ENSURING EFFECTIVENESS: ORDERING PROVISIONAL
MEASURES AND MONITORING COMPLIANCE

- I. INTRODUCTION / 482

 - II. NORMATIVE FRAMEWORK / 483
 - A. RULES OF PROCEDURE OF THE INTER-AMERICAN COURT OF HUMAN RIGHTS / 483
 - Article 26. Provisional Measures / 483
 - Article 54. Protection of Alleged Victims, Witnesses, and Expert Witnesses / 484
 - Article 63. Procedure for monitoring compliance with the Judgments and other decisions of the Court / 484
 - B. AMERICAN CONVENTION ON HUMAN RIGHTS / 484
 - Article 63 / 484
 - Article 65 / 485
 - Article 68 / 485

 - III. PROVISIONAL MEASURES / 485
 - Provisional Measures regarding Peru in the Matter of the Constitutional Court / 485
 - Provisional Measures regarding Costa Rica in the Matter of *La Nación* Newspaper / 495
 - Provisional Measures regarding Ecuador in the Matter of Pueblo Indígena Sarayaku / 516
 - Provisional Measures regarding Argentina in the Matter of Mendoza Prisons / 534
 - Provisional Measures regarding Colombia in the Matter of La Rochela Massacre / 606
 - Provisional Measures regarding Mexico in the Matter of Rosendo Cantú et al. / 611
 - Provisional Measures regarding Paraguay in the Matter of L.M. / 628
- ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT'S JURISPRUDENCE / 650**

IV.	MONITORING COMPLIANCE / 652
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of the Constitutional Court v. Peru / 653
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of Herrera Ulloa v. Costa Rica / 668
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of Almonacid-Arellano et. al v. Chile / 691
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of La Cantuta v. Peru / 702
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of Kimel v. Argentina / 718
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of Las Dos Erres v. Guatemala / 727
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of Cepeda Vargas v. Colombia / 760
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of La Rochela v. Colombia / 771
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of Velez Loo v. Panama / 781
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of Rosendo Cantu et al v. Mexico / 797
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of Radilla Pacheco v. United Mexican States / 800
	Monitoring Compliance with Judgment in the Case of Miguel Castro Castro Prison v. Peru / 853
	ANALYSIS AND QUESTIONS RAISED BY THE COURT'S JURISPRUDENCE / 863

	INDEX / 887
--	-------------